

SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1:

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	MS: 2012_AJEA_2868
Title of the Manuscript:	DETERMINANTS OF COMMERCIALIZATION OF SMALLHOLDER TOMATO AND PINEAPPLE FARMS IN GHANA.

General guideline for Peer Review process is available in this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)

- This form has total 9 parts. Kindly note that you should use all the parts of this review form.

SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 2: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	• Objectives are many but not addressed in the methodology and results. Be specific and measurable • No need of descriptive analysis for each district because they analysed on region basis • Correlation analysis on plot results should be presented • Results of correlation are not indicating the expected output. it seems that most of the variables have less than 0.4 correlation coefficient • No diagnostic test on multicollinearity, heteroscedasticity, endogeneity etc • There are appropriate model for analysing the relationship between commercialization and food security. Correlation is the simplest method without indicating the expected output	We disagree with most of the comments of this reviewer. The stated objectives have all been addressed appropriately. For example: the paper describes the characteristics of smallholder farmers – we used descriptive statistics (tables 3 to 10); analyses the relationship between commercialization and smallholder land holdings (correlation analysis – this has been done but there are too many tables to present. See also Tables 11 to 14); assesses the determinants of commercialization of smallholder agriculture in Ghana (regression analysis – Tables 15 & 16); assesses the benefits or otherwise of smallholder farmers from commercialization (figures 2 and 3); and discusses how commercialization affects household food security among smallholder farmers (correlation analysis as indicative only (Table 17). Note that the focus of this research has been the determinants of commercialization (see title of paper) for which a regression model was developed. Descriptive analysis for each district provide valuable district level differences and therefore useful.

SDI Review Form 1.6

		The correlation results are admittedly low, but those are also good results. They indicate that the variables we would normally expect to influence the key variables such as commercialization, food security, etc, are not doing that in the case of Ghana. This becomes more apparent in the regression analysis where most of the variables turned out to be insignificant. The comment about diagnostic test here is misplaced since we used cross-sectional data rather than time series data. As we have already mentioned, this research focused on finding the determinants of commercialization, and all other objectives were secondary. We agree that using correlation analysis for commercialization and food security is a simplified analysis, but we chose it above other methods because it is indicative only. A full analysis could be embarked on in another paper.
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	Sentence construction and grammar should be checked Referencing should be checked	

SDI Review Form 1.6

<u>Optional/General</u> comments	Revise based on the compulsory comment	